

What do you make of the Level 3 External?

This has become a common question in discussion and debates we set out on the last stage of implementing the changes to the achievement standards. No-one should expect the versions currently registered to be flawless or final: remember these were still being “tweaked” while earlier versions were being trialled and were only made available in the versions to be assessed about the time schools finished the 2012 academic year.

What follows is a two-person “unpacking” with no official status. It is a contribution to what must be an on-going discussion about the requirements of the standards considered. We believe it is important that the history teaching community has this discussion, that it is both vigorous and positive and contributes to collective understanding. If and where necessary, it should also generate pressure for revision or change. As you’ll see from the standards themselves the next scheduled review is 2016 but it is hard to believe that articulate discussion around any issues identified by teachers, examiners, markers or moderators (that is, the professional, informed community) won’t generate the impetus to bring earlier changes where problems appear.

The annotated standards:

Title	Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders				
Level	3	Credits	4	Assessment	External
Subfield	Social Science Studies				
Domain	History				
Status	Registered	Status date	4 December 2012		
Planned review date	31 December 2016	Date version published	4 December 2012		

Comment [P1]: This should clearly be the emphasis of the task(s) students face in the externals.

They should require ability to analyse against a number of concepts / concerns – see EN5.

Students clearly need skills in reading history (EN 4) but a clear and robust sense of what **evidence** is and how historians use it is also essential.

Comment [HL2]: Remember that this can occur outside New Zealand, it does not have to occur here to be of significance to us as New Zealanders

This achievement standard involves analysing evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.

Achievement Criteria

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyse, in depth, evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comprehensively analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.

Explanatory Notes

- This achievement standard is derived from *The New Zealand Curriculum*, Learning Media, Ministry of Education, 2007, Social Sciences learning area, and the Level 8 achievement objectives:

- Understand that the causes, consequences, and explanations of historical events that are of significance to New Zealanders are complex and how and why they are contested
- Understand how trends over time reflect social, economic, and political forces and is related to the material in the *Teaching and Learning Guide for History*, Ministry of Education, 2010 at <http://seniorsecondary.tki.org.nz>.

2 *Analyse* involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate understanding of historical concepts.

Analyse, in depth, involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate thorough understanding of historical concepts.

Comprehensively analyse involves using historians' skills to interpret evidence in order to demonstrate understanding of historical concepts, showing insight. Insight includes 'reading between the lines' to draw conclusions that go beyond the immediately obvious and demonstrate a high degree of engagement with the evidence.

3 *Evidence* is derived from sources. Sources may include: documents, pictures, graphs, maps, articles, speeches, cartoons, text books.

4 Historians' skills involve:

- close reading
- comprehension
- extracting meaning.

5 Historians' skills are used to identify historical concepts such as:

- perspectives
- past and present
- reliability and usefulness
- bias or propaganda
- continuity and change
- intent and motivation
- cause and effect
- specific and generalised
- influence and significance
- contingency.

6 *An historical event* is understood to be:

- an event, eg Hyde Rail Disaster, Kaitangata Mine Disaster, Napier Earthquake, Ballantyne's Fire
- an historical development or movement, eg Ratana, suffragettes, civil rights movements
- a person's role in and contribution to a significant historical event or movement, eg Kate Sheppard and Women's Suffrage, Nelson Mandela and civil rights in South Africa, Morrie Davis and the Mt Erebus Disaster.

7 *An event of significance to New Zealanders* is understood to be:

- an historical event occurring within New Zealand
- an historical international event involving New Zealanders
- an historical international event influencing New Zealanders.

8 *Significance* may be determined by:

- the importance of the event to people alive at the time
- how deeply people's lives were affected at the time
- how many lives were affected
- the length of time people's lives were affected
- the extent to which the event, or place, continues to affect society.

Comment [P3]: This is where the progression from Level 2 is. The experience and insights all should have gained from Level 3 research – and most should have gained at previous levels – all come into play here. We'll be drawing on that knowledge as we prepare the students for this external standard with discussions, read alouds, group work and mock external tasks.

Comment [P4]: Better – and more precise – to think about inference here. We'll be using all opportunities throughout the year to encourage students to exercise and refine their ability to infer by comparing new to known, using strategies to identify what is said and unsaid, drawing on all provided sources in a new context and, wherever possible, applying background knowledge.

Comment [P5]: Students are generally more comfortable and sophisticated in their approach to written sources. We will use the time freed by our control over content throughout the year to teach specific strategies for approaching and analysing visual and quantitative sources in the research modules that start our courses.-

Comment [P6]: Here Wineburg's work on how historians read is, in our view, vital. We will model, teach and use repeatedly a "before/during/after" reading strategy. This:
1. Begins by looking at the source and what information can be gleaned BEFORE it is read.
2. Annotating and commenting DURING reading making note of interesting or informative observations, comparing ...

Comment [P7]: Surely to God this must / should be "the relationship of the past to the present" as it is generally expressed in explorations of historical thinking and historical processes

Comment [P8]: Remember – the two aren't linked. "Unreliable" sources can still be historically useful.

Comment [P9]: Here they need a clear distinction. We're going with bias as (1) personal (2) unconscious and propaganda as being distinguished by (1) having a public intent (2) being a deliberate attempt to promote a view and persuade agreement.

Comment [P10]: We assume this means specific and general conclusions – this is probably what you get when the final version is "word-smithed" by people without specific disciplinary knowledge.

Comment [P11]: This seems to have caused some consternation but, again, it is a common concept off-shore. Choice and chance play roles in History and students need to know this. We now have time to consider and explore counterfactuals - and activity student ...

Comment [P12]: Although this is a standard definition, it is the reality of historical study that there is nothing inherent in a source that makes it suitable for a particular level. The progression lies in the level of sophistication required by the tasks.

9 Assessment Specifications for this achievement standard can be accessed through the History Resources page found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications-standards/qualifications/ncea/subjects/>.

Subject Reference	History 3.5		
Title	Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event		
Level	3	Credits	6
		Assessment	External
Subfield	Social Science Studies		
Domain	History		
Status	Registered	Status date	4 December 2012
Planned review date	31 December 2016	Date version published	4 December 2012

Comment [P13]: Here is the "step-up" for Level 3.

This achievement standard involves analysing the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.

Achievement Criteria

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyse, in depth, the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comprehensively analyse the causes and consequences of a significant historical event.

Explanatory Notes

2 This achievement standard is derived from The New Zealand Curriculum, Learning Media, Ministry of Education, 2007, Social Sciences learning area, and the Level 8 achievement objectives:

- Understand that the causes, consequences, and explanations of historical events that are of significance to New Zealanders are complex and how and why they are contested
- Understand how trends over time reflect social, economic, and political forces

and is related to the material in the Teaching and Learning Guide for History, Ministry of Education, 2010 at <http://seniorsecondary.tki.org.nz>.

2 Analyse involves explaining the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. This may involve establishing underlying and immediate causes and short term and long term consequences.

Analyse, in depth, involves evaluating the causes and consequences of a significant historical event. Evaluating includes the prioritisation of causes and consequences by justifying their relative significance.

Comprehensively analyse means to evaluate the causes and consequences of an historical event to support well-considered judgements that demonstrate understanding of the complexity of the causes and consequences.

3 A significant historical event is a specific event in time, eg:

- The Irish Famine
- Invasion of Parihaka
- Scottish Clearances
- Arrival of Tory in Wellington
- Fall of Singapore

Comment [P14]: This requires teaching / revision of the concepts. We intend doing this as part of our initial research modules where the clarification is equally useful. It will also feature in our work on contested history.

Comment [P15]: This was a more important cause / consequence because...

Here discussion and multiple "experiences" with the process are, in our view, the key to helping students build confidence in this area.

Our work on student writing – how to indicate and clarify argument and analysis, distinguish and emphasise important material etc. will all help (as will multiple tasks with paragraph, essay writing. It is also a chief factor in convincing one of us that "fancy" presentation formats are of less use to students than the chance to practice and refine their ability to write history.

Comment [P16]: Obviously qualitative, this looks to reward students who can weigh evidence and argument and put a clear, authoritative case.

- Massacre at Srebrenica
- Emancipation of American slaves
- Battle of Hastings
- Contagious Diseases Act 1867
- Married Women's Property Act 1882, England
- Amritsar **Massacre**.

- 4 Significance may be determined by:
- the impact and importance of the event on people over a period of time
 - how deeply people's lives were affected over a period of time
 - how many lives were affected
 - the length of time people's lives were affected
 - the extent to which the event continues to affect **society**.

- 5 Assessment Specifications for this achievement standard can be accessed through the History Resources page found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications-standards/qualifications/ncea/subjects/>.

Comment [P17]: It is important to note that all these events are quite specific and contained historical events but the causes leading up to them and the consequences resulting are broad and significant. Students should be guided (and contexts chosen) accordingly.

Comment [P18]: This concept and the criteria outlined are of clear use here, especially in evaluating consequences.

Subject Reference	History 3.6		
Title	Analyse a significant historical trend and the force(s) that influenced it		
Level	3	Credits	6
		Assessment	External
Subfield	Social Science Studies		
Domain	History		
Status	Registered	Status date	4 December 2012
Planned review date	31 December 2016	Date version published	4 December 2012

This achievement standard involves analysing a significant historical **trend** and the force(s) that influenced it.

Comment [P19]: From the Word thesaurus – tendency, drift, leaning, inclination, movement, development

Achievement Criteria

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Analyse a significant historical trend and the force(s) that influenced it. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Analyse, in depth, a significant historical trend and the force(s) that influenced it. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comprehensively analyse a significant historical trend and the force(s) that influenced it.

Explanatory Notes

- 3 This achievement standard is derived from *The New Zealand Curriculum*, Learning Media, Ministry of Education, 2007, Social Sciences learning area, and the Level 8 achievement objective:
- Understand how trends over time reflect social, economic, and political forces and is related to the material in the *Teaching and Learning Guide for History*, Ministry of Education, 2010 at <http://seniorsecondary.tki.org.nz>.
- 2 *Analyse* involves examining a significant historical trend and explaining the force(s) that influenced the **trend**.

Comment [P20]: The central concepts the students need robust working definitions of here: change, continuity, intent and motivation, contingency. Once again, we'll be looking to build on discussions, tasks and insights that have taken place in earlier modules and earlier years.

Analyse, in depth, involves assessing the importance of the force(s) that influenced a significant historical trend.

Comprehensively analyse involves examining the force(s) that influenced a significant historical trend and presenting well-considered judgements that demonstrate understanding of the complexity of the trend and/or the force(s).

- 3 *Force(s)* is an idea, concept, or condition which promotes social, political, cultural, environmental, or economic change or a combination of these.
- 4 A *significant historical trend* is understood to be a series of related events that has a range of causes and that illustrates significant social, political, cultural, environmental or economic changes and continuities over a period of time. Case studies should show a broad trend over time, eg:
 - Migration, eg British migration to New Zealand in the 19th Century: what force(s) in Britain influenced this migration, what changes and continuities occurred as a result of this in Britain and for Māori and Pakeha in New Zealand?
 - The trend of rebellion against autocracy in Russia: what force(s) influenced the rebellion, what changes and continuities occurred as a result of the rebellion in Russia?
 - Racism, eg Anti-Chinese racism in New Zealand: what force(s) influenced racism, what changes and continuities occurred as a result of the racism in New Zealand?
 - Changing roles of women, eg in England 1870 to 1930: what force(s) influenced changes in women's roles, what changes and continuities occurred as a result of this trend?
- 5 Significance may be determined by:
 - the importance of the event to people alive at the time
 - how deeply people's lives were affected at the time
 - how many lives were affected
 - the length of time people's lives were affected
 - the extent to which the event continues to affect society.
- 6 Assessment Specifications for this achievement standard can be accessed through the History Resources page found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications-standards/qualifications/ncea/subjects/>.

This article has also been put up separately on the NZHTA web site and a (page/strand?) set up on the forum. We're approaching some colleagues to contribute some initial observations or advice so please join in the conversation to help each other, and our students, attack the new standards as effectively, engagingly and productively as possible.

Comment [P21]: Hopefully any questions set will acknowledge that a specific list of what must be discussed may discriminate against particular contexts that may have been studied.

We'd also hope that the schedule accepted that detailed analysis of one or two aspects could also be rewarded.

On that issue, however, we'd argue that the social, political and economic factors specified in the current exemplar allow all other "forces" – religion having elements of all three, as does revolution, migration and so on.,

Comment [P22]: So – if I take British colonialism as a force, the trends in that – as it developed through exploration and exploitation to settlement, mercantilism, imperialism - and the social, political, cultural etc. changes that occurred for colonizer and colonized provide a rich context replete with case studies for my students to explore and present in the external.